A SIMPLE PROOF OF THE ZEILBERGER–BRESSOUD q-DYSON THEOREM

GYULA KÁROLYI AND ZOLTÁN LÓRÁNT NAGY

ABSTRACT. As an application of the Combinatorial Nullstellensatz, we give a short polynomial proof of the q-analogue of Dyson's conjecture formulated by Andrews and first proved by Zeilberger and Bressoud.

1. INTRODUCTION

Let $x_1, \ldots, x_n$ denote independent variables, each associated with a nonnegative integer a_i. Motivated by a problem in statistical physics Dyson [6] in 1962 formulated the hypothesis that the constant term of the Laurent polynomial

$$\prod_{1 \leq i \neq j \leq n} \left(1 - \frac{x_i}{x_j} \right)^{a_i}$$

is equal to the multinomial coefficient $(a_1 + a_2 + \cdots + a_n)!/(a_1! a_2! \ldots a_n!)$. Independently Gunson [unpublished] and Wilson [25] confirmed the statement in the same year, then Good gave an elegant proof [9] using Lagrange interpolation.

Let q denote yet another independent variable. In 1975 Andrews [2] suggested the following q-analogue of Dyson's conjecture: The constant term of the Laurent polynomial

$$f_q(\boldsymbol{x}) := f_q(x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_n) = \prod_{1 \leq i < j \leq n} \left(\frac{x_i}{x_j} \right)_{a_i} \left(\frac{q x_j}{x_i} \right)_{a_j} \in \mathbb{Q}(q)[\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{x}^{-1}]$$

must be

$$\frac{(q)_{a_1 + a_2 + \cdots + a_n}}{(q)_{a_1} (q)_{a_2} \ldots (q)_{a_n}},$$

where $(t)_k = (1 - t)(1 - tq) \ldots (1 - tq^{k-1})$ with $(t)_0$ defined to be 1. Specializing at $q = 1$, Andrews' conjecture gives back that of Dyson.

Despite several attempts [11, 22, 23] the problem remained unsolved until 1985, when Zeilberger and Bressoud [27] found a combinatorial proof. Shorter proofs for the equal parameter case $a_1 = a_2 = \ldots = a_n$ are due to Habsieger [10], Kadell [12] and Stembridge [24]; they cover the special case A_{n-1} of a problem of Macdonald [20] concerning root systems, which was solved in full generality by Cherednik [5]. A shorter proof of the Zeilberger–Bressoud theorem, manipulating formal Laurent series, was given by Gessel and Xin [8].

Following up a recent idea of Karasev and Petrov we present a very short combinatorial proof using polynomial techniques. We find that their proof of the Dyson conjecture in [15] naturally extends for Andrews' q-Dyson conjecture. We note that built on the same basic principles but with more sophisticated details it is possible to prove a whole family of constant term identities for Laurent polynomials, including the Bressoud–Goulden theorems [4], conjectures of Kadell [13, 14], the q-Morris constant term identity [10, 12, 21, 26] and its far reaching generalizations conjectured by Forrester [3, 7]; see [16, 17, 18]. We decided to publish this proof separately because of its sheer simplicity.

2. The proof

Note that if $a_i = 0$, then we may omit all factors that include the variable x_i without affecting the constant term of f_q. Accordingly, we may assume that each a_i is a positive integer. Consider the homogeneous polynomial

$$F(x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_n) = \prod_{1 \le i < j \le n} \left(\prod_{t=0}^{a_i - 1} (x_j - x_i q^t) \cdot \prod_{t=1}^{a_j} (x_i - x_j q^t) \right) \in \mathbb{Q}(q)[\boldsymbol{x}].$$

Clearly, the constant term of $f_q(\boldsymbol{x})$ is equal to the coefficient of $\prod_i x_i^{\sigma - a_i}$ in $F(\boldsymbol{x})$, where $\sigma = \sum_i a_i$. To express this coefficient we apply the following effective version of the Combinatorial Nullstellensatz [1] observed independently by Lasoń [19] and by Karasev and Petrov [15]. A sketch of the proof is included for the sake of completeness.

Lemma 2.1. *Let $\mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary field and $F \in \mathbb{F}[x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_n]$ a polynomial of degree $\deg(F) \le d_1 + d_2 + \cdots + d_n$. For arbitrary subsets $A_1, A_2, \ldots, A_n$ of $\mathbb{F}$ with $|A_i| = d_i + 1$, the coefficient of $\prod x_i^{d_i}$ in F is*

$$\sum_{c_1 \in A_1} \sum_{c_2 \in A_2} \cdots \sum_{c_n \in A_n} \frac{F(c_1, c_2, \ldots, c_n)}{\phi_1'(c_1) \phi_2'(c_2) \ldots \phi_n'(c_n)},$$

where $\phi_i(z) = \prod_{a \in A_i} (z - a)$.

Proof. Construct a sequence of polynomials $F_0 := F, F_1, \ldots, F_n \in \mathbb{F}[\boldsymbol{x}]$ recursively as follows. For $i = 1, \ldots, n$, let $F_i = F_i(\boldsymbol{x})$ denote the remainder obtained after dividing $F_{i-1}(\boldsymbol{x})$ by $\phi_i(x_i)$ over the ring $\mathbb{F}[x_1, \ldots, x_{i-1}, x_{i+1}, \ldots, x_n]$. This process does not affect the coefficient of $\prod x_i^{d_i}$. The polynomial F_n satisfies $F_n(\boldsymbol{c}) = F(\boldsymbol{c})$ for all $\boldsymbol{c} \in A_1 \times \cdots \times A_n$ and its degree in x_i is at most d_i for every i. The unique polynomial with that property is expressed in the form

$$F_n(\boldsymbol{x}) = \sum_{\boldsymbol{c} \in A_1 \times \cdots \times A_n} F(\boldsymbol{c}) \prod_{i=1}^{n} \prod_{\substack{\gamma \in A_i \\ \gamma \ne c_i}} \frac{x_i - \gamma}{c_i - \gamma}$$

by the Lagrange interpolation formula, hence the result. $\square$

The idea is to apply this lemma taking $\mathbb{F} = \mathbb{Q}(q)$ with a suitable choice of the sets A_i such that $F(\boldsymbol{c}) = 0$ for all but one element $\boldsymbol{c} \in A_1 \times \cdots \times A_n$. Put $A_i = \{1, q, \ldots, q^{\sigma - a_i}\}$, then $|A_i| = \sigma - a_i + 1$; and introduce $\sigma_i = \sum_{j=1}^{i-1} a_j$. Thus, $\sigma_1 = 0$ and $\sigma_{n+1} = \sigma$.

Claim 2.2. *For $\boldsymbol{c} \in A_1 \times \cdots \times A_n$ we have $F(\boldsymbol{c}) = 0$, unless $c_i = q^{\sigma_i}$ for all i.*

Proof. Suppose that $F(\boldsymbol{c}) \ne 0$ for the numbers $c_i = q^{\alpha_i} \in A_i$. Here α_i is an integer satisfying $0 \le \alpha_i \le \sigma - a_i$. Then for each pair $j > i$, either $\alpha_j - \alpha_i \ge a_i$, or $\alpha_i - \alpha_j \ge a_j + 1$. In other words, $\alpha_j - \alpha_i \ge a_i$ holds for every pair $j \ne i$, with strict inequality if $j < i$. In particular, all of the α_i are distinct. Consider the unique permutation π satisfying $\alpha_{\pi(1)} < \alpha_{\pi(2)} < \cdots < \alpha_{\pi(n)}$. Adding up the inequalities $\alpha_{\pi(i+1)} - \alpha_{\pi(i)} \ge a_{\pi(i)}$ for $i = 1, 2 \ldots, n-1$ we obtain

$$\alpha_{\pi(n)} - \alpha_{\pi(1)} \ge \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} a_{\pi(i)} = \sigma - a_{\pi(n)}.$$

Given that $\alpha_{\pi(1)} \ge 0$ and $\alpha_{\pi(n)} \le \sigma - a_{\pi(n)}$, strict inequality is excluded in all of these inequalities. It follows that π must be the identity permutation and $\alpha_i = \alpha_{\pi(i)} = \sum_{j=1}^{i-1} a_{\pi(j)} = \sigma_i$ must hold for every $i = 1, 2, \ldots, n$. This proves the claim. $\square$

This way finding the constant term of f_q is reduced to the evaluation of

$$\frac{F(q^{\sigma_1}, q^{\sigma_2}, \ldots, q^{\sigma_n})}{\phi_1'(q^{\sigma_1}) \phi_2'(q^{\sigma_2}) \ldots \phi_n'(q^{\sigma_n})},$$

where $\phi_i(z) = (z-1)(z-q) \ldots (z - q^{\sigma - a_i})$. Here

$$\phi_i'(q^{\sigma_i}) = \prod_{t=0}^{\sigma_i-1}(q^{\sigma_i}-q^t)\cdot\prod_{t=\sigma_i+1}^{\sigma-a_i}(q^{\sigma_i}-q^t)$$

$$= \prod_{t=0}^{\sigma_i-1}q^t(q^{\sigma_i-t}-1)\cdot\prod_{t=1}^{\sigma-\sigma_{i+1}}q^{\sigma_i}(1-q^t)$$

$$= (-1)^{\sigma_i}q^{\tau_i}\,(q)_{\sigma_i}\,(q)_{\sigma-\sigma_{i+1}}$$

with $\tau_i = \binom{\sigma_i}{2}+\sigma_i(\sigma-\sigma_{i+1})$, whereas

$$F(q^{\sigma_1},q^{\sigma_2},\ldots,q^{\sigma_n}) = \prod_{1\le i<j\le n}\left(\prod_{t=0}^{a_i-1}q^{\sigma_i+t}(q^{\sigma_j-\sigma_i-t}-1)\cdot\prod_{t=1}^{a_j}q^{\sigma_i}(1-q^{\sigma_j-\sigma_i+t})\right)$$

$$= (-1)^u q^v \prod_{1\le i<j\le n}\left(\frac{(q)_{\sigma_j-\sigma_i}}{(q)_{\sigma_j-\sigma_{i+1}}}\cdot\frac{(q)_{\sigma_{j+1}-\sigma_i}}{(q)_{\sigma_j-\sigma_i}}\right)$$

$$= (-1)^u q^v \prod_{i=1}^{n}\frac{(q)_{\sigma_i}\,(q)_{\sigma-\sigma_i}}{(q)_{\sigma_{i+1}-\sigma_i}}$$

with $u = \sum_i(n-i)a_i$ and $v = \sum_i\left((n-i)a_i\sigma_i+(n-i)\binom{a_i}{2}+\sigma_i(\sigma-\sigma_{i+1})\right)$.

In view of the simple identity $\sum_i(n-i)a_i = \sum_i\sigma_i$, we have $u = \sum_i\sigma_i$, thus the powers of -1 cancel out. The same happens with the powers of q due to the following observation, which implies $v = \sum_i\tau_i$.

Claim 2.3. $\sum_i(n-i)\left(a_i\sigma_i+\binom{a_i}{2}\right) = \sum_i\binom{\sigma_i}{2}$.

Proof. We proceed by a routine induction on n. When $n=0$, both expressions are 0, and one readily checks the relation

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(a_i\sigma_i+\binom{a_i}{2}\right) = \binom{\sigma_{n+1}}{2},$$

which completes the induction. □

Putting everything together we obtain that the constant term of f_q is indeed

$$\frac{F(q^{\sigma_1},q^{\sigma_2},\ldots,q^{\sigma_n})}{\phi_1'(q^{\sigma_1})\phi_2'(q^{\sigma_2})\ldots\phi_n'(q^{\sigma_n})} = \prod_{i=1}^{n}\frac{(q)_{\sigma_i}\,(q)_{\sigma-\sigma_i}}{(q)_{\sigma_i}\,(q)_{\sigma-\sigma_{i+1}}\,(q)_{\sigma_{i+1}-\sigma_i}}$$

$$= \frac{(q)_\sigma}{\displaystyle\prod_{i=1}^{n}(q)_{\sigma_{i+1}-\sigma_i}}$$

$$= \frac{(q)_{a_1+a_2+\cdots+a_n}}{(q)_{a_1}\,(q)_{a_2}\ldots(q)_{a_n}}.$$

References

1. N. Alon, Combinatorial Nullstellensatz, Combin. Probab. Comput. **8** (1999) 7–29.
2. G. E. Andrews, Problems and prospects for basic hypergeometric functions, in: Theory and Application of Special Functions, R. A. Askey, ed., Academic Press, New York (1975), pp. 191–224.
3. T. H. Baker and P. J. Forrester, Generalizations of the q-Morris constant term identity, J. Combin. Th. A **81** (1998) 69–87.
4. D. M. Bressoud and I. P. Goulden, Constant term identities extending the q-Dyson theorem, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **291** (1985) 203–228.
5. I. Cherednik, Double affine Hecke algebras and Macdonald's conjectures, Annals of Math. **141** (1995) 191–216.
6. F. J. Dyson, Statistical theory of energy levels of complex systems, J. Math. Phys. **3** (1962) 140–156.
7. P. J. Forrester, Normalization of the wawefunction for the Calogero–Sutherland model with internal degrees of freedom, Int. J. Mod. Phys. B **9** (1995) 1243–1261.
8. I. M. Gessel and G. Xin, A short proof of the Zeilberger–Bressoud q-Dyson theorem, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **134** (2006) 2179–2187.
9. I. J. Good, Short proof of a conjecture by Dyson, J. Math. Phys. **11** (1970) 1884.

10. L. Habsieger, Une q-intégrale de Selberg–Askey, SIAM J. Math. Anal. **19** (1988) 1475–1489.

11. K. W. J. Kadell, A proof of Andrews's q-Dyson conjecture for $n = 4$, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **290** (1985) 127–144.

12. K. W. J. Kadell, A proof of Askey's conjectured q-analogue of Selberg's integral and a conjecture of Morris, SIAM J. Math. Anal. **19** (1988) 969–986.

13. K. W. J. Kadell, Aomoto's machine and the Dyson constant term identity, Methods Appl. Anal. **5** (1998) 335–350.

14. K. W. J. Kadell, A Dyson constant term orthogonality relation, J. Combin. Th. A **89** (2000) 291–297.

15. R. N. Karasev and F. V. Petrov, Partitions of nonzero elements of a finite field into pairs, Israel J. Math., to appear.

16. Gy. Károlyi, Note on a problem of Kadell, manuscript.

17. Gy. Károlyi, A. Lascoux, and S. O. Warnaar, Constant term identities and Poincaré polynomials, submitted.

18. Gy. Károlyi and Z. L. Nagy, Proof of a q-Aomoto integral and a conjecture of Forrester, manuscript.

19. M. Lasoń, A generalization of Combinatorial Nullstellensatz, Electron. J. Combin. **17** (2010) #N32, 6 pages.

20. I. G. Macdonald, Some conjectures for root systems, SIAM J. Math. Anal. **13** (1982) 988–1007.

21. W. G. Morris, Constant Term Identities for Finite and Affine Root Systems, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Wisconsin, Madison, 1982.

22. R. P. Stanley, The q-Dyson conjecture, generalized exponents, and the internal product of Schur functions, Combinatorics and Algebra (Boulder, 1983), Contemp. Math. **34**, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, 1984, pp. 81–94.

23. R. P. Stanley, The stable behavior of some characters of $\mathrm{SL}(n, \mathbb{C})$, Lin. Multilin. Alg. **16** (1984) 3–27.

24. J. R. Stembridge, A short proof of Macdonald's conjecture for the root systems of type A, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **102** (1988) 777–786.

25. K. G. Wilson, Proof of a conjecture by Dyson, J. Math. Phys. **3** (1962) 1040–1043.

26. D. Zeilberger, A Stembridge–Stanton style elementary proof of the Habsieger–Kadell q-Morris identity, Discrete Math. **79** (1989) 313–322.

27. D. Zeilberger and D. Bressoud, A proof of Andrews's q-Dyson conjecture, Discrete Math. **54** (1985) 201–224.

School of Mathematics and Physics, The University of Queensland, Brisbane, QLD 4072, Australia
E-mail address: karolyi@cs.elte.hu

Alfréd Rényi Institute of Mathematics, Reáltanoda utca 13–15, Budapest, 1053 Hungary
E-mail address: nagyzoltanlorant@gmail.com